MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING
Arizona Livestock Loss Board
X Diamond Ranch
Southfork
Eagar, AZ 85925

Monday, April 18, 2016

PRESENT: (Board Members)
Stephen Clark
Sarahmarge Crigler
Jim F. O'Haco
Clay Parsons
Dr. George Ruyle
Larry D. Voyles, Chairman
Kevin McFee, designee of Mark Killian

(Staff)

Kevin Kinsall
Paul Greer
AZGFD

*****

1. Welcome

Chairman Voyles called the meeting to order at **1:35 p.m.** This meeting followed an agenda dated April 13, 2016.

*****

2. Roll Call

Mr. Kinsall led the roll call and noted attendance of the Board members.
Board members present were; Stephen Clark from Glendale, representing Wildlife Conservation & Knowledge of Livestock; Sarahmarge Crigler from Springerville, representing Livestock Industry; Jim O'Haco from Winslow, representing Livestock Industry; Clay Parsons from Marana, representing Livestock Auction Market Owner; Dr. George Ruyle from Tucson, representing Faculty Member at University; and Larry Voyles from Phoenix, Director of AZ Game & Fish Department. Not present but represented was Mark Killian from Phoenix, Director of AZ Department of Agriculture. The designee for Mark Killian was Kevin McFee. Not present for this meeting were; Ken Van de Graaff from Gilbert, representing Livestock Industry and James Unmacht from New River, representing Wildlife Conservation & Knowledge of Livestock.

*****

3. Review and approve minutes of December 17, 2015 meeting

The members individually reviewed the drafted minutes.

MOTION: APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE DECEMBER 17, 2015 MEETING AS WRITTEN. Stephen Clark moved and Jim O'Haco seconded.

VOTE: Unanimous

*****

4. Call to the Public

Chairman Voyles invited any public attendees who wanted to be heard to present their Blue Speaker Cards.

Carey Dobson, owner and partner of Timberline Ranch, addressed the board. Mr. Dobson spoke about current programs in place and his experiences working with different organizations. He reflected upon his activities contending with the presence of wolves on and surrounding his ranch in regards to conflict avoidance measures utilized, which included electric fences, range riders, and hazing. On several occasions, Mr. Dobson has had to relocate his herds, and he discussed the efforts and costs involved with relocation action. These additional costs and efforts include fuel, water, supplemental feeding, additional man power, fencing, etc. Mr. Dobson has experienced over a hundred depredations of his cattle and sheep since the reintroduction of the Mexican Gray wolf. Mr. Dobson described his history regarding current compensation programs and financial supports, to include Defenders of Wildlife, the Arizona Game and Fish Department, the Coexistence Council, and the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. He also remarked upon the lack of funding available and the slow, cumbersome processes currently in place in some organizations. Compensation has been made based on the current market value of the animals, but the costs incurred through conflict avoidance and the reduced production capacity of the ranch is not addressed. It was calculated that Mr. Dobson is at best being compensated for approximately 25% of the total impact and losses experienced due to the wolves.

*****

5. Staff Presentation / Discussion

Mr. Kinsall distributed three draft forms to the Board for their evaluation. These forms were modeled after programs in Montana: a Pay for Presence Application, a Livestock Compensation Claim Form, and a Loss Prevention Grant Application. These forms were explained and discussed. It was agreed that simplification of forms would be ideal and overreach of information should be minimized. It was suggested that the Pay for Presence Application and the Loss Prevention Grant Application be merged into one form and one program. The Board also discussed current programs in other states and their current processes.

Discussion ensued regarding potential funding opportunities. Among these opportunities were Arizona Game and Fish Department Grant Funds that are currently sent to the Mexican Wolf / Livestock Coexistence Council, seeking permanent federal appropriations, amending the Farm

Bill to earmark monies for endangered and threatened species, and developing an insurance profile similar to crop insurance. Overall, the Board agreed on the conclusion that federal programs should be funded with federal monies, and it was right and appropriate for the federal government to reimburse the ranchers for the costs incurred while facilitating the federal Mexican Gray Wolf recovery program.

*****

6. Future Agenda Items

The action items for the next Board meeting include:

- A report on a "livestock" insurance program (Parsons)
- A consolidated application form combining the Loss Prevention Grant application and the Pay for Presence Program Application
- Responses to The Cost of the Wolf – Washington Ranchers (handout) to reframe dialogue
- Review of economic analysis prepared by University of AZ, School of Agriculture on the cost of ranching (Ruyle)

The Board will set a date and time for the next meeting.

*****

Chairman Voyles adjourned this meeting at **4:53 p.m.**

*****

I attest that these minutes were reviewed and approved by the members of the Livestock Loss Board on August 3, 2016.

Larry D. Voyles

Larry D. Voyles, Chairman